

HUFFMAN & REJEBIAN

RESEARCH / PUBLIC RELATIONS

Candidate Research: Jonathan Chane

18th Congressional House District of Florida

Dec. 8, 2015

This report includes a summary of potentially damaging or otherwise notable lawsuits in which Jonathan Chane has been involved as an attorney, as well as his political contributors and his personal voting history. If desired, we can further review any lawsuits of interest on the ground in Palm Beach County.

Lawsuits

We reviewed lawsuits involving Jonathan Chane in his capacity as a Palm Beach County attorney representing clients on behalf of the Greenberg Traurig law firm, including 159 state and federal civil suits and cases that garnered media attention. No criminal cases were found.

The most notable cases were those that showed Chane consistently representing big banks and home mortgage lenders in foreclosure cases against individuals and businesses beginning in 2007. In addition, he is currently defending the tobacco industry, specifically Lorillard Tobacco Co., in product liability cases pending in Palm Beach County.

Foreclosure cases

Between May 7, 2007, and April 10, 2013, Chane represented banks and other lenders that sued individuals and businesses in 37 foreclosure cases originating in Palm Beach County. Those years include the height of the national mortgage crisis (from Sept. 2008 to Sept. 2012, approximately four million foreclosures were

completed in the U.S.). In two other cases, Chane served as defense counsel for lenders, as noted below.

The banks, lenders and financial services companies that Chane represented were:

- Aurora Loan
- Bank of America
- Bank of New York
- Chase Home Finance
- Citibank
- Deutsche Bank
- HSBC Bank
- J.P. Morgan Chase Bank
- LaSalle Bank
- One West Bank
- Washington Mutual
- Wells Fargo Bank
- Wilmington Trust

According to the Palm Beach County court records database, Chane was counsel for banks and other lenders in the following property foreclosure cases (by earliest date):

- **Bank of New York v Stephen J. Remondini (502007CA007013)**, filed May 7, 2007. Chane represented Bank of New York. Additional defendants included Loggers Run Inc.
- **Citibank v St. Remy Delva (502007CA013116)**, filed Aug. 7, 2007. Chane represented Citibank. Additional defendants included Suzette Delva, the Casablanca Isles Condominium Association, Mortgage Electronic Registration Systems and Dolphin Contracting.
- **Washington Mutual v Nelson Diaz (502007CA016511)**, filed Sept. 26, 2007. Chane represented Washington Mutual. Additional defendants included Long Beach Mortgage Company and Tomy Garcia.
- **Washington Mutual v Patricia Golden (502008CA005409)**, filed Feb. 25, 2008. Chane represented additional plaintiff J. P. Morgan Chase Bank.
- **Washington Mutual v Hayme Guerra**, filed March 6, 2008. Chane represented Washington Mutual.
- **Citibank v Charlotte A. Parker (502008CA007805)**, filed March 14, 2008. Chane represented additional plaintiff Wilmington Trust, National Association as Successor Trustee. Additional defendants included Gerald C. Parker, Graham C. Miller.

- **Citibank NA v Keturah T. Joseph (502008CA009377)**, filed March 28, 2008. Chane represented Citibank. Additional defendants included Marysol Garcia, Woodcrest Homeowners' Association, Sears Roebuck and Co., Citibank South Dakota National Association.
- **Countrywide v David Cohn (502008CA10688)**, filed April 10, 2008. Chane represented additional plaintiff J.P. Morgan Chase Bank. Additional defendants included Damara L. Cohn, Verano at Delray Condominium Association, Mortgage Electronic Registration Systems.
- **Chase Home Finance v Bruce E. Ganger (502008CA11988)**, filed April 28, 2008. Chane represented Chase. Additional defendants included Peggy Ganger, Chase Bank USA National Association, Colony Preserve of Boynton Beach Homeowners' Association.
- **Chase Home Finance v David Mosquera (502008CA022151)**, filed July 21, 2008. Chane represented Chase. Additional defendants included Elizabeth Mosquera, Resort at Singer Island.
- **Deutsche Bank v Alain Perez (502008CA025040)**, filed Aug. 15, 2008. Chane represented Deutsche. Additional defendants included Abner Pedraza, Heather Pedraza, Shakerwood Association, Village of Wellington.
- **Chase Home v Jacqueline Vanhorne (502008CA029157)**, filed Sept. 22, 2008. Chane represented Chase. Additional defendants included J.P. Morgan Chase Bank, Countryside Estates Association.
- **LaSalle Bank v Pyfecstone Florestal (502008CA033729)**, filed Oct. 24, 2008. Chane represented LaSalle. Additional defendants included Rainberry Woods Homeowners' Association, Yilonite Florestal.
- **Deutsche Bank National Trust v Anthony E. Bambara (502008CA035405)**, filed Nov. 7, 2008. Chane represented Deutsche Bank. Additional defendants included Cathy Bambara, National City Bank.
- **Bank of New York v David J. Mosquera (502008CA040969)**, filed Dec. 22, 2008. Chane represented Bank of New York. Additional defendants included Elizabeth Mosquera, J.P. Morgan Chase Bank, Postley Village Homeowners' Association, Olympia Master Association.
- **Chase Home Finance v Merry Jean Herrera (502008CA040331)**, filed Dec. 22, 2008. Chane represented Chase. Additional defendants included Bjarne Storm, J.P. Morgan Chase Bank, Colmar Manor Inc.

- **J.P Morgan Chase Bank v Sanija Soljic (502009CA000279)**, filed Jan. 6, 2009. Chane represented J.P. Morgan. Additional defendants included Citibank National Association and four tenants.
- **J.P. Morgan Chase Bank v Kourosch Alipour (502009CA003666)**, filed Jan. 29, 2009. Chane represented J.P. Morgan.
- **Chase Home v Yulemis Denis (502009CA014763)**, filed May 1, 2009. Chane represented Chase. Additional defendants included Jorge L. Castillo.
- **J. P. Morgan v Peter R. Mercier (502009CA016835)**, filed on May 11, 2009. Chane represented J. P. Morgan Chase. Additional defendants included Estancia Palm Springs Homeowners' Association, Edwin Horowitz, Nelly Horowitz, Lou Bachrodt Chevrolet and Jerome M. Fisher.
- **J.P. Morgan v Kimberley Leach (502009CA018883)**, filed May 28, 2009. Chane represented J.P. Morgan. Additional defendants included Dennis Czark, Boca Tierra Homeowners' Association.
- **J.P. Morgan Chase v Shlomo Rasabi (502009CA019696)**, filed June 4, 2009. Chane represented J.P Morgan.
- **J.P. Morgan Chase Bank v Jean B. Domond (502009CA033182)**, filed Sept. 25, 2009. Chane represented J.P. Morgan. Additional defendants included the Lee's Crossing Homeowners' Association and Anna Domond.
- **Chase Home v James Farrell (502009CA033768)**, filed Sept. 30, 2009. Chane represented Chase. Additional defendants included Carye L. Farrell.
- **One West Bank v Ricot Jean Simon (502009CA034367)**, filed Oct. 6, 2009. Chane represented One West. Additional defendants included Paulucienne Jean Simon, Strawberry Lakes Master Corporation.
- **Wells Fargo Bank v Errol Kowlessar (502009CA038189)**, filed Nov. 9, 2009. Chane represented Wells Fargo. Additional defendants included Judy Kowlessar.
- **Aurora Loan v Michelle Gunn (502009CA040707)**, filed Dec. 2, 2009. Chane represented Aurora Loan. Additional defendants included Mortgage Electronic Registration Systems, Greg A. Watts.
- **Wells Fargo Bank v Arlene Lichtenstein (502009CA041367)**, filed Dec. 7, 2009. Chane represented Wells Fargo. Additional defendants included Eugene Klein, Megan Klein (minor), USA, Capital One Bank USA, Rachel E. Coursey, Regency Cove Association.

- **Chase Home Finance v Ismithe Verly (502010CA001594)**, filed Jan. 15, 2010. Chane represented Chase. Additional defendants included Liferne Verly, Morgan Chase Bank, Village of Sandalwood Lakes Homeowners' Association and Village of Palm Beach Lakes Property Homeowners' Association.
- **HSBC Bank USA v Mary Beth Jagger (502010CA002935)**, filed Jan. 27, 2010. Chane represented HSBC. Additional defendants included John Jagger.
- **Wells Fargo Bank v Mark E. Jigarjian (502010CA005386)**, filed Feb. 12, 2010. Chane represented Wells Fargo. Additional defendants included Edward Jigarjian, J.P. Morgan Chase Bank National Association, Camino Real Village Association, Boca Del Mar Improvement Association.
- **J.P. Morgan Chase Bank v William N. Duffey Jr. (502010CA013264)**, filed May 14, 2010. Chane represented J.P. Morgan.
- **LaSalle Bank v Raoul Olivier Cedras (502010CA017092)**, filed June 30, 2010. Chane represented LaSalle. Additional defendants included Christine Rocourt Cedras, Mortgage Electronic Registration Systems, B.W. Homeowners' Association, Boca Winds Homeowners' Association, Southeast Mortgage Trust.
- **Bank of America v Timothy A. Beach (502010CA019418)**, filed July 28, 2010. Chane represented Bank of America. Additional defendants included Joanne Ricci, Channing Villas Homeowners' Association.
- **Deutsche Bank v Robert J. Ackerman (502010CA020392)**, filed Aug. 10, 2010. Chane represented Deutsche Bank. Additional defendants included the city of West Palm Beach and unknown tenants.
- **Verona Palms Homeowners' Association v Brian Louis Schoenberg (502011CC010494)**, filed July 13, 2011. Chane represented additional defendant Washington Mutual Bank Federal Association doing business as J. P. Morgan Chase Bank.
- **Isola Bela Homeowners v J.P. Morgan Chase Bank (502011CA014092)**, filed Sept. 15, 2011. Chase represented defendant J.P. Morgan.
- **J.P Morgan v Paul C. Thompson (502011CA015503)**, filed Sept. 30, 2011. Chane represented J.P. Morgan.
- **J. P. Morgan Chase Bank v Maranda Crittenden (0502013CA006402)**, filed April 10, 2013. Chane represented J.P. Morgan. Additional defendants included Gwendolyn Crittenden, Melton Crittenden, USA, Cityside Condominium Association.

Tobacco cases

Chane serves as defense counsel in five product liability cases which are currently pending against RJ Reynolds Tobacco Co., Lorillard Tobacco Co., Altria Group Inc., Vector Group LTD, the Council for Tobacco Research, the Tobacco Institute, Liggett Group and Philip Morris USA.

The cases are among about 8,000 pending throughout Florida since the state Supreme Court in 2006 threw out a \$145 billion jury verdict in a Miami-Dade class-action lawsuit against cigarette makers. Though the high court upheld the jury's findings about the dangers of smoking, it ruled that each person must prove their unique damages at separate trials. Of the more than 100 that have gone to trial statewide, about two-thirds of the verdicts have been in favor of smokers or their families, according to records kept by the Tobacco Products Liability Project Northwestern University School of Law in Boston.

Chane is listed as representing Lorillard in the following cases (by earliest date):

- **Jimmy Bell v RJ Reynolds Tobacco**, filed on Jan. 7, 2008. Chane is listed as representing defendant Lorillard Tobacco Co. in the case.
- **Rushie Osby v RJ Reynolds Tobacco**, filed on Jan. 9, 2008. Chane is listed as representing defendant Lorillard Tobacco Co. in the case.
- **Shirley Hymowitz v RJ Reynolds Tobacco**, filed on Jan. 9, 2008. Chane is listed as representing defendant Lorillard Tobacco Co. in the case.
- **Mary Morelle v RJ Reynolds Tobacco**, filed Jan. 10, 2008. Chane is listed as representing defendant Lorillard Tobacco Co. in the case.
- **Ida Queen v RJ Reynolds Tobacco**, filed on Jan. 11, 2008. Chane is listed as representing defendant Lorillard Tobacco Co. in the case.

Federal cases

Of 34 federal court cases reviewed, the one notable action was a lawsuit in which Chane represented five current or retired diplomatic security officers at the U.S. Department of State against Secretary of State Hillary Clinton and her department.

The March 2010 lawsuit challenged the department's decision to collect alleged salary overpayments for the work of five individuals in Iraq in 2004. The five men – Richard Lublow, Joseph Bopp, David Bennett, Frank Benevento and James Landis – challenged the department's determination that their pay exceeded overtime limits

and the decision to deny waiver of repayment. Repayment amounts ranged from \$435.94 to \$10,514.98. Each plaintiff disputed the debt.

In the end, U.S. District Judge John Bates decided to go along with a previous decision by the Foreign Service Grievance Board which had heard an administrative appeal of the case and not disturb the board's conclusion that collection of the overpayments made to the five men was not "against equity and good conscience" and was in "the best interests of the United States." Bates dismissed the suit against Clinton and the State Department on Jan. 28, 2013.

Cases that have attracted media attention

Chane has attracted very little media attention as a practicing attorney. The biggest cases to garner news stories involved The Omphoy Ocean Resort, which he represented and which was found to be in violation of town codes that prohibited a line of four "beach beds" along the shore and a shaded cabana.

In what sounds relatively innocuous compared with his big tobacco and foreclosure cases, Chane argued in Feb. 2010 that the town code was not applicable to beach beds, which he compared to beach chairs and umbrellas rather than structures, according to the *Palm Beach Daily News* on Feb. 19, 2010.

Just a month before, Chane had been before the same code enforcement board making "an organized and vigorous protest" that a shaded beach cabana used by beach boys to hand out towels to hotel guests should not have to be removed despite the board's contention that it violated town code, the newspaper reported.

Chane lost both cases and the hotel was fined \$150 in each case and ordered to remove the beach beds and the cabana.

Campaign contributors

Aside from one political committee and one candidate loan, all of the campaign contributions listed for candidate Jonathan Chane and Chane for Congress on the FEC's website are from individuals. The following list from the FEC database was cross-referenced with the databases of Campaignmoney.com and Followthemoney.org, as of the last filing on Sept. 30, 2015.

Followthemoney.org lists Chane as both Jonathan Chane and Jonathan Charles Chane, employed by Greenberg Traurig LLP (Cunningham Whalen & Gaspari is also listed under employer). Chane for Congress is listed as "no designated party," which differentiates it from contributions listed from designated Democrats.

The websites show Chane and his campaign receiving 280 contributions totaling \$300,522, including a \$100,000 personal candidate loan; the FEC total is \$1 less, and references a \$1 contribution refund with no further details. No PAC contributions were reported, though there is a \$1,000 contribution from the National Cemetery Association (listed below) under “other political committees.”

According to the FEC, 62.2 percent of Chane’s contributions came from individuals and 33.3 percent from that candidate loan, with the remainder from unitemized individual contributions (the latter totaling \$12,568, presumably those made through ActBlue, ranging from \$50 to \$1,000, which can be traced to individuals). The totals are the same for candidate Jonathan Chane and Chane for Congress.

The following are among the top contributors (more than \$500), with a few lesser contributions also noted. Some are earmarked, such as for the primary or general election campaign, which we have noted when different campaigns were specified by the same individual.

- 2700 Kevin McGann, Palm Beach, self employed
- 2700 Gary Frucci, Naples, retired
- 2700 Jane Frucci, Naples, retired *primary*
- 2700 *same as above but for general, not primary*
- 2700 Harold J. Glasband, NY Melric Technologies CEO
- 2700 *same as above but for general*
- 2700 Mark Pinsky, West Palm Beach plastic surgeon
- 2700 Robert M. Rubenstein, Miami attorney
- 2700 *same as above but for general*
- 2700 Valerie Winchester, Palm Beach, not employed
- 1700 *same as above but for general*
- 1000 *same as above but for primary*
- 2700 Cesar Alvarez, Greenberg Traurig
- 2700 Betsy R. Sheerr, Philadelphia PA media/communications
- 2700 Greg P. Huber, Jupiter trial lawyer
- 2700 Gregory T. Zele, Palm Beach Gardens trial lawyer
- 2700 Arnold I. Chane, Palm Beach Gardens, retired
- 2700 *same as above but for general*
- 2700 Amy Bahl, Palm Beach, not employed
- 2700 Craig S. Storch, Palm Beach Gardens financial advisor
- 2700 Mark Bideau, Greenberg Traurig
- 2700 Larry J. Hoffman, Greenberg Traurig
- 2700 Brett Langbert, Jupiter wealth advisor
- 2700 Lisa Lickstein, Palm Beach Gardens, not employed
- 2450 Adam Schlesinger, Gulf Stream real estate
- 2250 James Anderson Jr., Des Plaines IL developer
- 2140 Bob Bovarnick, Tampa photographer
- 2100 Howard Gellis, Palm Beach Gardens financial consultant
- 2000 Richard Schlesinger, West Palm Beach real estate

- 2000 Timothy W. Schultz, West Palm Beach attorney
- 2000 Sanford M. Baklor, Palm Beach Gardens, not employed
- 1800 H. Irwin Levy, West Palm Beach attorney
- 1500 Richard B. Comiter, Palm Beach Gardens attorney
- 1500 Jason Okleshen, Greenberg Traurig
- 1500 Gus Davis, New York City, VP Camilla Dietz Bergeron
- 1500 Edward Sumpter, New York City antiques dealer
- 1500 Greg Cohen, North Palm Beach attorney
- 1500 Gregory R. Cohen, Palm Beach Gardens attorney *same employer as above*
- 1200 Phillip Hutchinson, Greenberg Traurig
- 1000 Diane Belfer, Palm Beach, retired
- 1000 Mark F. Levy, West Palm Beach developer
- 1000 Dean Goodman, Palm Beach broadcaster
- 1000 Joseph P. Mecca, Jacksonville engineer
- 1000 Joseph Mecca, St. Johns engineer
- 1000 Benjamin Gordon, Palm Beach investment banker
- 1000 Jason Payant, Western Springs IL financial planner
- 1000 Bridget A. Berry, Greenberg Traurig
- 1000 Gary Lesser, West Palm Beach attorney
- 1000 Michael Cohen, Pompano Beach, not employed
- 1000 Lisa Seymour, Palm Beach Gardens media specialist
- 1000 Herb Shear, Palm Beach, not employed
- 1000 Barry S. Berg, Palm Beach Gardens banker
- 1000 Ezra Katz, Miami real estate
- 1000 Courtney Fisch, West Palm Beach realtor
- 1000 Patricia Cambo, Greenberg Traurig
- 1000 Todd Stabinski, Miami attorney
- 1000 Matthew B. Gorson, Greenberg Traurig
- 1000 Jason Fedo, Greenberg Traurig
- 1000 Milton Fine, Palm Beach, retired
- 1000 Bente Lyons, Palm Beach Gardens, retired
- 1000 Sean D. Miller, Palm Beach National Land Tenure Co. partner
- 1000 Peter Liebman, West Palm Beach auto dealer
- 1000 James Nederlander, New York City production company president
- 1000 Harold Oertel, Palm Beach Gardens retired
- 1000 Richard A. Williamson, Scarsdale NY attorney
- 1000 Laurie Gildan, Greenberg Traurig
- 1000 Patrick Joseph Tighe, West Palm Beach attorney
- 1000 Bruce Rosetto, Greenberg Traurig
- 1000 David Thomas, Walpole MA attorney
- 1000 David Layman, Greenberg Traurig
- 1000 Brian Duffy, Denver CO attorney, Greenberg Traurig
- 1000 Adele W. Shamban, Palm Beach Gardens, retired
- 1000 Thomas F. Myers, Arlington VA corporate counsel
- 1000 National Association of Cemeteries d/b/a International CE

- 565 Laurie Chane, Tampa attorney
- 550 Cappy Lerman Abraham, Palm Beach realtor
- 540 Jack Scarola, Jupiter attorney
- 540 Christian D. Searcy, West Palm Beach attorney
- 540 John Shipley III, Delray attorney
- 540 Gregory Barnhart, Pompano partner Searcy & Denney

All other contributions are for \$500 or less -- mostly from attorneys, realty firms or people who work in real estate, retirees, marketing consultants or Greenberg Traurig employees, as well as the Samuel and Erna Liebovich Foundation.

Chane's personal voting history

According to the Palm Beach County supervisor of elections, Jonathan Chane (born in 1973) registered to vote in 1998 and has voted in every election since.

As always, we remain available for follow-up research related to this report and can provide documentation for its findings.

120 North Congress St., Suite 1101, Jackson MS 39201
601/214-9638, 601/353-5009 hollygrove2@gmail.com
mrejebian@huffmanrejebian.com